## Library research awards evaluation rubric

Category	Not evident (0)	Limited	Good evidence	Superior	Score
		evidence (1)	(2)	evidence (3)	
Resource	No evidence of	Limited	Good evidence	Superior	
Usage:	library	evidence of	of library	evidence of	
Substantial use	resource usage	library	resource usage	library	
of library	in paper or	resource usage	in paper and	resource usage	
resources and	reflective essay	in paper or	essay – use of	in paper and	
collections in	– sources	essay –	library	essay –	
any format,	mainly drawn	evidence of	resources is	superior use of	
including but	from online	use in paper	generally	library	
not limited to	non-library	and essay may	appropriate	resources	
printed	resources, little	not match,	and relevant to	relevant to	
resources,	to no evidence	limited use of	topic, sources	topic, sources	
databases,	of use of	library	are generally	are all or	
primary	library	resources,	good but may	superior	
resources, and	resources,	sources aren't	have some	(nearly all	
materials in all	sources are	strong and the	faults (age,	appropriately	
media.	generally weak	majority have	authority,	authoritative,	
	or missing	faults (age,	diversity,	timely, diverse,	
		authority,	relevancy, etc.)	relevant, etc.)	
		diversity,			
		relevancy, etc.)			
Original	No evidence of	Limited	Good evidence	Superior	
Thought:	original	evidence of	of original	evidence of	
Ability to	thought –	original	thought –	original	
locate, select,	research paper	thought –	author's	thought –	
		_	_		
evaluate, and	is entirely	author's	original	author's	
evaluate, and synthesize	is entirely others'	author's original	thoughts show	original	
evaluate, and synthesize library	is entirely others' thoughts with	author's original thoughts rely	thoughts show originality and	original thoughts show	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or	author's original thoughts rely heavily on	thoughts show originality and do not rely	original thoughts show superior	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others'	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on	original thoughts show superior originality and	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others'	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others'	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future original	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to future original	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to lead to original	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates superior	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to lead to original research in the	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future original	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to future original	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates superior potential for	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to lead to original	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future original	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to future original	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates superior potential for future original	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to lead to original research in the future.	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or perspective	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future original research.	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to future original research.	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates superior potential for future original research.	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to lead to original research in the future.	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or perspective	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future original research.	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to future original research.	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates superior potential for future original research. Superior	
evaluate, and synthesize library resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality and/or has the potential to lead to original research in the future.	is entirely others' thoughts with no synthesis or analysis to demonstrate author's original thought or perspective	author's original thoughts rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has limited potential to lead to future original research.	thoughts show originality and do not rely heavily on others' thoughts and/or has good potential to lead to future original research.	original thoughts show superior originality and are wholly separate from others' thoughts and/or demonstrates superior potential for future original research.	

		T	T .		
personal	demonstrated	learning	demonstrated	learning	
learning	in paper or	demonstrated	in paper and	demonstrated	
through the	essay –	in paper or	essay –	in paper and	
research	research skills	essay –	demonstrated	essay –	
process.	and subject	research skills	advancement	demonstrated	
	knowledge do	and/or subject	in research	significant	
	not seem to	knowledge	skills and/or	advancement	
	advance	advance	subject	in research	
	through the	somewhat	knowledge	skills and/or	
	process or final	through the	through the	subject	
	output	process or final	process and	knowledge	
	'	output,	final output.	through the	
		possibly only		process and	
		shown in one.		final output.	
Research	No evidence of	Limited	Good evidence	Superior	
Habits:	research habit	evidence of	of research	evidence of	
Development	development –	research habit	habit	research habit	
of a habit of	neither paper	development –	development –	development –	
research and	nor essay	paper and/or	paper and/or	paper and	
inquiry that	demonstrate	essay	essay	essay	
shows the	application of	demonstrate	demonstrate	demonstrate	
likelihood of	research	limited	good	significant	
persisting in	process or	application of	application of	application of	
the future.	inquiry of	research	research	research	
the ratare.	research to	process or	process or	process or	
	future research	inquiry of	inquiry of	inquiry of	
	habits.	research to	research to	research to	
	Habits.	future research	future research	future research	
		habits.	habits.	habits.	
Quality	Low quality	Medium			
Quality:	Low quality		Good quality	Superior	
Mastery of	paper, with little to no	quality paper,	paper, with	quality paper,	
content		with some	good mastery	with superior	
appropriate to	mastery of	mastery of	of content	mastery of	
class level,	content	content	appropriate to	content	
clear writing,	appropriate to	appropriate to	class level,	appropriate to	
and an overall	class level,	class level,	high-level	class level,	
high quality of	poor writing,	medium-level	writing, and/or	superior-level	
presentation.	and/or low	writing, and/or	high-level	writing, and/or	
	quality of	medium-level	quality of	superior-level	
	presentation.	quality of	presentation.	quality of	
		presentation.	_	presentation.	_
Bowles	Not evident (0)	Limited	Good evidence	Superior	Bowles Score
categories		evidence (2)	(4)	evidence (6)	
W. Donald	Paper does not	Paper	Paper	Paper	
<b>Bowles Award</b>	fit the	demonstrates	demonstrates	demonstrates	
Undergraduate	definition of	a limited	a good	a superior	
ONLY:	the award –	approach to	approach to	approach to	
Undergraduate	does not	the	the	the	

T					
level papers	demonstrate	identification,	identification,	identification,	
demonstrate	an approach to	description,	description,	description,	
thoughtful	the	and discussion	and discussion	and discussion	
approaches to	identification,	of wealth	of wealth	of wealth	
the	description,	inequality,	inequality,	inequality,	
identification,	and discussion	poverty,	poverty,	poverty,	
description,	of wealth	and/or other	and/or other	and/or other	
and discussion	inequality,	topics related	topics related	topics related	
of wealth	poverty,	to the	to the	to the	
inequality,	and/or other	consequences	consequences	consequences	
poverty, and/or	topics related	of economic	of economic	of economic	
other topics	to the	disparities.	disparities.	disparities.	
related to the	consequences	Approach may	Approach may	Approach may	
	of economic			be clear,	
consequences		be unclear,	be mostly	·	
of economic	disparities.	unfocused,	clear, mostly	focused, highly	
disparities.		tangentially	focused,	related, and/or	
		related, and/or	mostly related,	is the sole	
		not the	and/or is	focus of the	
		primary focus	generally the	paper.	
		of the paper.	primary focus		
			of the paper.		
W. Donald	Paper does not	Paper	Paper	Paper	
<b>Bowles Award</b>	fit the	demonstrates	demonstrates	demonstrates	
Graduate	definition of	limited	good thought	superior	
ONLY:	the award –	thought and	and research	thought and	
Graduate-level	does not	research into	into wealth	research into	
papers	demonstrate	wealth	inequality,	wealth	
demonstrate	deep, original	inequality,	poverty,	inequality,	
deep, original	thought and	poverty,	and/or other	poverty,	
thought and	research into	and/or other	topics related	and/or other	
research into	wealth	topics related	to the	topics related	
wealth	inequality,	to the	consequences	to the	
inequality,	poverty,	consequences	of economic	consequences	
poverty, and/or	and/or other	of economic	disparities.	of economic	
other topics	topics related	disparities.	May rely	disparities.	
related to the	to the	May rely	somewhat on	Does not rely	
			others'	on others'	
consequences	consequences	heavily on			
of economic	of economic	others'	thought in	thought in	
disparities, in	disparities.	thoughts or	additional to	additional to	
addition to		contain	original	own thought	
above criteria.		unoriginal or	thought or	and contains	
		surface-level	contain	original and	
		thought.	somewhat	deep thought.	
			original or		
			somewhat		
			deep thought.		
Total					

- Resource Usage: Substantial use of library resources and collections in any format, including but not limited to printed resources, databases, primary resources, and materials in all media.
- Original Thought: Ability to locate, select, evaluate, and synthesize library
  resources and to use them in the creation of a project that shows originality
  and/or has the potential to lead to original research in the future.
- Learning: Evidence of significant personal learning through the research process.
- Research Habits: Development of a habit of research and inquiry that shows the likelihood of persisting in the future.
- Quality: Mastery of content appropriate to class level, clear writing, and an overall high quality of presentation.
- W. Donald Bowles Award: Undergraduate level papers demonstrate thoughtful
  approaches to the identification, description, and discussion of wealth inequality,
  poverty, and/or other topics related to the consequences of economic disparities,
  in addition to above criteria. Graduate-level papers demonstrate deep, original
  thought and research into wealth inequality, poverty, and/or other topics related
  to the consequences of economic disparities, in addition to above criteria.